Yugoslav Journal of Operations Research 33 (2023), Number 3, 467-480 DOI: https://doi.org/10.2298/YJOR220915005D

# UNRAVELLING THE ASSIGNMENT PROBLEM UNDER INTUITIONISTIC TRIANGULAR FUZZY ENVIRONMENT BY THE NOVEL HEURISTIC DHOUIB-MATRIX-AP1

# Souhail DHOUIB

OLID Laboratory, Higher Institute of Industrial Management, University of Sfax, TUNISIA souhail.dhouib@gmail.com

Received: September 2022 / Accepted: February 2023

**Abstract**: The Assignment Problem (AP) can be stated as *n* activities to be assigned to *n* resources in such a way that the overall cost of assignment is minimized and each activity is assigned to one and only one resource. In real-life, the parameters of the AP are presented as uncertain numbers due to the lack of knowledge, experiences or any other (internal or external) factor. In this paper, the AP is considered under intuitionistic triangular fuzzy number and solved by the novel constructive heuristic Dhouib-Matrix-AP1 (DM-AP1) with a time complexity of O(n). Actually, this paper presents the first enhancement of the novel heuristic DM-AP1 to solve the AP under intuitionistic triangular fuzzy environment. DM-AP1 is composed of three simple steps: computing the total cost, selecting the highest value and finding the minimal element. These steps are repeated in *n* iterations with the use of a standard deviation statistical metric. Two case studies of AP under intuitionistic triangular fuzzy set are taken from the literature and a step-by-step application of the novel DM-AP1 heuristic is presented for more clarification.

**Keywords**: Operations research, combinatorial optimization, assignment problem, intuitionistic fuzzy set, Dhouib-Matrix, soft computing.

MSC: 90B80, 90C59, 03F55

# **1. INTRODUCTION**

A simplified variant of the well-known Transportation Problem is the Assignment Problem (AP) where all supply and demand quantities are unique (only one) and the main of the objective function is to minimize the total cost of assigning objects (Tasks, Jobs) to other objects (Machines, Workers) so that each object is allocated to only one resource. Various optimization methods have been proposed to solve the AP: The Hungarian method [1], the Linear Programming [2], the Kurtzberg's method [3], the Auction Algorithm [4], the Efficient Cost Scaling Algorithm [5], the Neural Network [6], the Genetic Algorithm

[7], the Simulated Annealing [8], the Tabu Search Algorithm [9], the Artificial Bee Colony [10], the Ant Colony Optimization [11], the Water Drops Algorithm [12].

In this field, we designed a new constructive heuristic in [13] named Dhouib-Matrix-AP1 (DM-AP1) composed of three simple steps (see Figure 1) repeated n iterations (where n is the number of objects to be assigned). Actually, DM-AP1 requires a polynomial time complexity of O(n) whereas the Hungarian method needs a time complexity of O(n3). Moreover, DM-AP1 is designed regardless the objective function (not as the Hungarian method which is dedicated for the linear sum objective function). Furthermore, DM-AP1 is helpful for the unbalanced Assignment Problem (with constraint on the agents) which outperforms the Hungarian method [14]. Another main advantage of DM-AP1 is its flexibility to use different statistical metrics (Min, Max, Average, Standard Deviation, etc.) in order to generate several initial basic feasible solutions (in this paper the standard deviation metric is used).



Figure 1: The three simple steps of the DM-AP1 heuristic

In this paper, the novel DM-AP1 method is enhanced to solve the AP under intuitionistic triangular fuzzy environment where the cost parameters are presented as intuitionistic triangular fuzzy numbers (depending on external or internal factors: knowledge, experience and education, etc.). In fact, the intuitionistic fuzzy logic was introduced by [15] in order to wider the concept of fuzzy logic proposed by [16]. The intuitionistic concept was used in several fields: the Travelling Salesman Problem [17], the Classical linear sum Assignment Problem [18, 19], the Bottleneck Assignment Problem [20], the Transportation Problem [21], the Knapsack Problem [22], the Forecasting [23], the Cancer Mediating Biomarkers Recognition [24], the Cloud Vendor Selection [25, 26] and the Station Location Selection [27]. Also, the intuitionistic concept was used for the medical diagnostic [28, 29], the pattern recognition [30], the soft graphs [31], the cycles and trees [32], the education [33] and the answer set programming [34].

Indeed, the main contribution of this paper is the introduction of a new methodology to solve the Assignment Problem under intuitionistic triangular fuzzy environment through the adaptation of the novel DM-AP1 heuristic. This paper is structured as follows: In Section 2, some basic definitions of the intuitionistic triangular fuzzy set are introduced. In section 3, the proposed method DM-AP1 is described and in section 4 two case studies are step-by-step presented for more clarification. Finally, the conclusion and further research are presented.

# 2. BASIC DEFINITIONS

# 2.1. Definition 1

Let *X* be a nonempty set. A fuzzy set  $\tilde{E}$  in *X* is defined as  $\tilde{E} = \{\langle x, \mu_{\tilde{E}}(x) \rangle; x \in X\}$ . Where  $\mu_{\tilde{E}}(x)$  is called membership function which maps each element of *X* to a value between 0 and 1.

## 2.2. Definition 2

A fuzzy number  $E = (e_1, e_2, e_3)$  is defined to be a triangular fuzzy number (where  $e_1 \le e_2 \le e_3$ ) if its membership functions  $\mu_E(x) : \Box \rightarrow [0,1]$  is equal to

$$\mu_{\bar{E}}(x) = \begin{cases} 0 & \text{for } x < e_1 \\ \frac{x - e_1}{e_2 - e_1} & \text{if } e_1 \le x \le e_2 \\ 1 & \text{if } x = e_2 \\ \frac{e_3 - x}{e_3 - e_2} & \text{if } e_2 \le x \le e_3 \\ 0 & \text{for } x > e3 \end{cases}$$

## 2.3. Definition 3

An intuitionistic fuzzy set,  $\tilde{E}^{I} = \left\{ \left\langle x, \mu_{\tilde{E}^{I}}(x), \vartheta_{\tilde{E}^{I}}(x) \right\rangle; x \in X \right\}$  is characterized by its two membership function: the degree of membership function  $\mu_{\tilde{E}^{I}}(x)$  and the degree of non-membership function  $\vartheta_{\tilde{E}^{I}}(x)$  of the element x (where  $\mu_{\tilde{E}^{I}}(x)$ ,  $\vartheta_{\tilde{E}^{I}}(x)$  is a function from X to [0,1] such that  $0 \leq \mu_{\tilde{E}^{I}}(x) + \vartheta_{\tilde{E}^{I}}(x) < 1, \forall x \in X$ ).

#### 2.4. Definition 4

An intuitionistic fuzzy numbers  $\tilde{E}' = (e_1, e_2, e_3)(e_1, e_2, e_3)$  is called to be intuitionistic triangular fuzzy number if its membership function is of the form:

$$\mu_{\tilde{E}'}(x) = \begin{cases} 0 & \text{for } x < e_1 \\ \frac{x - e_1}{e_2 - e_1} & \text{if } e_1 \le x \le e_2 \\ 1 & \text{if } x = e_2 \\ \frac{e_3 - x}{e_3 - e_2} & \text{if } e_2 \le x \le e_3 \\ 0 & \text{for } x > e_3 \end{cases} \quad \text{and} \quad \mathcal{G}_{\tilde{E}'}(x) = \begin{cases} 1 & \text{for } x < e_1 \\ \frac{e_2 - x}{e_2 - e_1} & \text{if } e_1 \le x \le e_2 \\ 0 & \text{if } x = e_2 \\ \frac{x - e_2}{e_3 - e_2} & \text{if } e_2 \le x \le e_3 \\ 1 & \text{for } x > e_3 \end{cases}$$

#### 2.5. Definition 5

If  $\tilde{E}^{I} = (e_1, e_2, e_3)(e_1, e_2, e_3)$  is an intuitionistic triangular fuzzy number then the ranking of  $\tilde{E}^{I}$  can be given using the ranking function (Equation 1) developed by Varghese and Kuriakose in [34]:

$$\Re\left(\tilde{E}'\right) = \frac{1}{3} \left[ \frac{\left(e_{3}' - e_{1}'\right)\left(e_{2} - 2e_{3}' - 2e_{1}'\right) + \left(e_{3} - e_{1}\right)\left(e_{1} + e_{2} + e_{3}\right) + 3\left(e_{3}'^{2} - e_{1}'^{2}\right)}{e_{3}' - e_{1}' + e_{3} - e_{1}} \right]$$
(1)

For example, the intuitionistic triangular fuzzy number  $\tilde{E}' = (7,21,29)(2,21,34)$  is converted to a crisp number as follows:

$$\Re\left(\tilde{E}'\right) = \frac{1}{3} \left[ \frac{(34-2)(21-2*34-2*21)+(29-7)(7+21+29)+3(34^2-2^2)}{34-2+29-7} \right].$$

# 2.6. Definition 6

The Assignment Problem (AP) can be specified as n objects (activities) to be allocated to n other objects (resources) where the overall cost of assignment is minimized and each activity is assigned to one and only one resource. The mathematical formulation of the intuitionistic fuzzy assignment problem can be presented as:

$$Min \ \tilde{Z}^{I} = \sum_{i=1}^{n} \sum_{j=1}^{n} \tilde{c}_{ij}^{I} x_{ij}$$

Subject to

$$\sum_{j=1}^{n} x_{ij} = 1, \text{ for } i = 1, 2, ...n$$
$$\sum_{i=1}^{n} x_{ij} = 1, \text{ for } j = 1, 2, ...n$$

Where

 $\begin{cases} x_{ij} = 1 & \text{if the } i^{th} \text{ job is assigned to the } j^{th} \text{ machine} \\ x_{ij} = 0 & \text{Otherwise} \end{cases}$ 

Where *i* and *j* are respectively the index of objects (for examples jobs) to be assigned to other objects (for example machine). Moreover, a binary variable  $x_{ij}$  is used and object *i* is allocated to object *j* then  $x_{ij} = 1$  otherwise  $x_{ij} = 0$ . Furthermore, the cost  $\tilde{c}_{ij}^{I}$  is the intuitionistic fuzzy cost of assigning object *i* to object *j*.

# 3. THE PROPOSED METHOD: DHOUIB-MATRIX-AP1

The Dhouib-Matrix-AP1 (DM-AP1) method was firstly designed and developed under Python programming language in [13] in order to solve the classical Assignment Problem.

Next, an application of the DM-AP1 to solve the trapezoidal fuzzy AP is presented in [36]. Moreover, a new stochastic variant of DM-AP1 entitled DM-AP2 is developed in [14] in order to optimize the unbalanced assignment problem where the constraint is on the agents (more realistic in real world where the number of resources is less than the number of jobs).

DM-AP1 and DM-AP2 are a component of the general concept of Dhouib-Matrix (DM) where several new optimization methods are designed. For the Travelling Salesman Problem, the deterministic Dhouib-Matrix-TSP1 and the stochastic Dhouib-Matrix-TSP2 heuristics are developed [37, 38, 39, 40, 41]. Concerning the Transportation Problem, the Dhouib-Matrix-TP1 technique is designed in [42, 43]. Regarding the Shortest Path Problem, a new exact method entitled Dhouib-Matrix-SPP (DM-SPP) is intended in [44]. DM-SPP presents a complexity of O(n+m) where *n* is the number of vertices and *m* is the number of edges. This new method is concurrent to the Dijkstra method for complete graphs and outperforms Dijkstra for incomplete graphs.

Besides, three novel metaheuristics are designed in the field of DM: 1) the iterated stochastic Dhouib-Matrix-3 (DM3) metaheuristic [45, 46, 47], 2) the local search Far-to-Near (FtN) method [48] and 3) the multi-start Dhouib-Matrix-4 (DM4) method [49, 50, 51].

In this paper, DM-AP1 is applied for the classical Assignment Problem where all input data are presented as intuitionistic triangular fuzzy numbers. DM-AP1 is composed of one iterative structure gathering three simple steps repeated in *n* iterations (see Figure 2).



Figure 2: The three steps of the DM-AP1 method

The proposed method DM-AP1 is a constructive heuristic (the algorithm of DM-AP1 is presented in Figure 3), its aim is just to generate an initial basic feasible solution. Thus, for larger instances an iterative structure is required and the DM-AP1 will be used as a good starting solution for any metaheuristic (such as the novels DM3 [44] or DM4 [46] methods). Moreover, different descriptive statistical metrics can be used to generate different initial basic feasible solutions: Thus, DM-AP1 will be nicely used as diversification technique for the DM3 or DM4 metaheuristics.

The advantages of the novel DM-AP1 method are that:

- Only one iterative structure with three simple steps.
- The solution is generated after only n iterations: the computational time is O(n).

- 472 S. Dhouib / Assignment Problem under Intuitionistic Triangular Fuzzy Environment
  - It can be expanded to solve other variants of AP under certain or uncertain environment.

Algorithm of Dhouib-Matrix-AP1 (DM-AP1)					
nput: Assignment matrix, <i>n</i> = number of tasks					
output: Optimal or near optimal assignment network plan					
. Initialize S=∞					
. Set Assignment-Plan = {}					
. For <i>i</i> =1 to <i>n</i>					
. Compute the total cost for each row and each column using the					
Standard Deviation function.					
. Select the highest element (Z) from the highest total cost element.					
. Choose the minimal element (at the position $d_{xy}$ ) in the					
corresponding Z.					
. Insert x and y in the list Assignment-Plan					
. Discard row x and column y					
. Compute S from Assignment-Plan					
0. Return S and Assignment-Plan					

Figure 3: The algorithm of the proposed DM-AP1 method

# 4. NUMERICAL EXAMPLES

Two numerical case studies are presented in the next subsections in order to give more clarification about the application of DM-AP1: the first one deals about assigning three workers to three jobs and the second case study describes the assignment of four jobs to four machines.

#### 4.1. Illustrative case study 1

Let us consider the problem of TV manufacturing (taken from [19]) with three workers  $(W_1, W_2 \text{ and } W_3)$  and three jobs  $(J_1: \text{ assembling}, J_2: \text{ testing and } J_3: \text{ packing})$ . Only one job is assigned to each worker with an intuitionistic triangular fuzzy performing time (in hours) and the deal is to find the assignment plan that minimizes the total working time. Figure 4 depicts the  $3\times3$  assignment matrix.

[(7,21,29)(2,21,34)]	(7, 20, 57)(3, 20, 61)	(12.25.56)(8,25,60)				
(8,9,16)(2,9,22)	(4,12,35)(1,12,38)	(6,14,28)(3,14,31)				
(5,9,22)(2,9,25)	(10,15,20)(5,15,25)	(4,16,19)(1,16,22)				
Figure 4: The intuitionistic triangular fuzzy performance time						

Figure 4: The intuitionistic triangular fuzzy performance time

Iteration 1: Before starting DM-AP1 the intuitionistic triangular fuzzy numbers are transformed to crisp ones using Equation (1). Next, compute the standard deviation for each row and column and select the highest value (7.8) which is at the third column. Now, select the smallest element in the third column (13) at position  $d_{33}$  (assign worker  $W_3$  to job  $J_3$ ) and discard row 3 and column 3 (see Figure 5).

Iteration 2: Again, compute the standard deviation for each row and column, select the highest value (5.5) which is at the second column and find the smallest element at the

second column (17) at position  $d_{22}$  (assign worker  $W_2$  to job  $J_2$ ) and discard row 2 and column 2 (see Figure 6).

	J1	J2	J3	
W1	19	28	31	5.0
W2	11	17	16	2.6
W3	12	15	13	1.2
	3.5	5.7	7.8	

Figure 5: Assign worker (W3) to job (J3)

	J1	J2	J3	
W1	19	28	31	4.5
W2	11	17	16	3.0
W3	12	15	13	
	4.0	5.5		

Figure 6: Assign worker (W2) to job (J2)

Iteration 3: Besides, compute the standard deviation for each row and column (0.0), select the highest value (0.0) and choose its corresponding smallest element  $d_{11}$  (assign worker  $W_1$  to job  $J_1$ ) and discard row 1 and column 1 (see Figure 7).

	J1	J2	J3			
W1	197	28	31	0.0		
W2	11	17	16			
W3	12	15	13			
	0.0					
Figure 7: Assign worker (W1) to job (J1)						

Thus, the optimal solution is 49 and graphically depicted in Figure 8 for  $W_1 \rightarrow J_1$ ,  $W_2 \rightarrow J_2$  and  $W_3 \rightarrow J_3$  ( $x_{11}^* = x_{22}^* = x_{33}^* = 1$ ). The corresponding intuitionistic triangular fuzzy value is calculated via the crisp optimal solution:

 $(7, 21, 29)(2, 21, 34)x_{11}^{*} + (4, 12, 35)(1, 12, 38)x_{22}^{*} + (4, 16, 19)(1, 16, 22)x_{33}^{*} = (15, 49, 83)(4, 49, 94)$ 

In the above example, the solution generated by DM-AP1 (after n=3 iterations) remains same as that obtained by [19] using the PSK method and by Hungarian method but with a more complicated process and iterations: the Hungarian method requires  $(n^3=3^3=27)$ iterations.



474 S. Dhouib / Assignment Problem under Intuitionistic Triangular Fuzzy Environment

Figure 8: The assignment networks plan for the 3x3 matrix

The optimal intuitionistic triangular fuzzy solution is graphically represented in Figure 9. The degree of acceptance ( $\mu_{\tilde{E}^I}(x)$ ) beyond [15, 83] hours is totally unacceptable for the decision maker and will be totally satisfied with the total assignment time value of 49 hours (the degree of acceptance increases from 14 to 49 hours and then decreases until 83 hours). Similarly, the degree of non-acceptance ( $\mathcal{G}_{\tilde{E}^I}(x)$ ) is totally unacceptable beyond [4, 49], fully acceptable at 49 hours, decreases from 4 to 49 hours and increases from 49 to 94 hours.



Figure 9: Graphical representation of the minimal total intuitionistic cost using the DM-AP1 heuristic

	0	for <i>x</i> < 15			1	for $x < 4$
	$\frac{x-15}{34}$	if $15 \le x \le 49$			$\frac{49-x}{45}$	if $4 \le x \le 49$
$\mu_{\tilde{E}'}(x) = \langle$	1	if $x = 49$	and	$\mathcal{G}_{\tilde{E}'}(x) = \langle$	0	if $x = 49$
	$\frac{83-x}{34}$	if $49 \le x \le 83$			$\frac{x-49}{45}$	if $49 \le x \le 94$
	0	for $x > 83$			1	for <i>x</i> > 94

#### 4.2. Illustrative case study 2

Let us consider the problem of assigning four jobs  $(J_1, J_2, J_3 \text{ and } J_4)$  to four machines  $(M_1, M_2, M_3 \text{ and } M_4)$  (taken from [19]). Figure 10 depicts the intuitionistic triangular fuzzy number.

(27, 50, 109)(13, 50, 123)	(56, 67, 111)(40, 67, 127)	(8, 22, 120)(4, 22, 124)	(75, 100, 128)(62, 100, 141)			
(52, 68, 93)(44, 68, 101)	(43, 90, 119)(35, 90, 127)	(34, 56, 93)(18, 56, 109)	(60, 70, 89)(50, 70, 99)			
(72, 80, 109)(58, 80, 123)	(78, 90, 108)(65, 90, 121)	(85, 98, 150)(76, 98, 159)	(52, 68, 93)(44, 68, 101)			
(23, 40, 81)(17, 40, 87)	(44, 58, 90)(38, 58, 96)	(63, 89, 109)(49, 89, 123)	(64, 72, 95)(51, 72, 108)			
Figure 10: The intuitionistic triangular fuzzy matrix						

Iteration 1: At first, transform the intuitionistic triangular fuzzy numbers to crisp ones using equation (1). Next, compute the standard deviation for each row and column and select the highest value (23.6) which is at the third column. Then, find the smallest element in the third column (50) at position  $d_{13}$  (assign job  $J_3$  to machine  $M_1$ ) and discard row 1 and column 3 (see Figure 11).

	J1	J2	J3	J4	
M1	62	78	50	101	19.0
М2	71	84	61	73	8.1
М3	87	92	111	71	14.2
M4	48	64	87	77	14.6
	14.1	10.2	23.6	12.0	

Figure 11: Assign job (J3) to machine (M1)

Iteration 2: Next, compute the standard deviation for each row and column, select the highest value (16) which is at the first column and find the smallest element at the fourth column (48) at position  $d_{41}$  (assign job  $J_1$  to machine  $M_4$ ) and discard row 4 and column 1 (see Figure 12).

	J1	J2	J3	J4	
М1	62	78	50	101	
М2	71	84	61	73	5.7
МЗ	87	92	111	71	8.9
M4	48	64	87	77	11.8
	16.0	11.7		2.4	

Figure 12: Assign job (J1) to machine (M4)

Iteration 3: Hence, compute the standard deviation for each row and column, select the highest value (10.5) which is at the third row and find the smallest element at the fourth column (71) at position  $d_{34}$  (assign job  $J_4$  to machine  $M_3$ ) and discard row 3 and column 4 (see Figure 13).

476 S. Dhouib / Assignment Problem under Intuitionistic Triangular Fuzzy Environment



Figure 13: Assign job (J4) to machine (M3)

Iteration 4: Moreover, compute the standard deviation for each row and column (0.0), select the highest value (0.0) and select its corresponding smallest element  $d_{22}$  (assign job  $J_2$  to worker  $W_2$ ) and discard row 2 and column 2 (see Figure 14).

	J1	J2	J3	J4	
M1	62	78	50	101	
М2	71	84	61	73	0.0
МЗ	87	92	111	71	
M4	48	64	87	77	
		0.0			

Figure 14: Assign job (J2) to machine (M2)

Thus, DM-AP1 needs only (n = 4) simple iterations to generate the assignment network (graphically depicted in Figure 15):  $J_1 \rightarrow M_3$ ,  $J_2 \rightarrow M_2$ ,  $J_3 \rightarrow M_4$  and  $J_4 \rightarrow M_1$  so  $(x_{13}^* = x_{22}^* = x_{34}^* = x_{41}^* = 1)$ . This solution is the optimal one (253), also found by the Hungarian method but with a more complicated process and iterations (the Hungarian method requires  $(n^3=4^3=64)$  iterations). Also, the corresponding intuitionistic triangular fuzzy value can be calculated via the crisp optimal solution:

 $(8, 22, 120)(4, 22, 124)x_{13}^* + (43, 90, 119)(35, 90, 127)x_{22}^* + (52, 68, 93)(44, 68, 101)x_{34}^* + (23, 40, 81)(17, 40, 87)x_{41}^* = (126, 220, 413)(100, 220, 439)$ 



Figure 15: The assignment network plan for the 4x4 matrix

The optimal intuitionistic triangular fuzzy solution is graphically represented in Figure 16. The degree of acceptance  $(\mu_{\tilde{E}^I}(x))$  beyond [126, 413] is totally unacceptable for the decision maker and will be totally satisfied with the total assignment time value of 220 (the degree of acceptance increases from 126 to 220 and then decreases until 413 hours). Similarly, the degree of non-acceptance  $((\vartheta_{\tilde{E}^I}(x)))$  is totally unacceptable beyond [100, 439], fully acceptable at 220, decreases from 100 to 220 and increases from 220 to 439.



Figure 16: Graphical representation of the minimal total intuitionistic cost using the DM-AP1 heuristic

$$\mu_{\tilde{E}^{I}}(x) = \begin{cases} 0 & \text{for } x < 126 \\ \frac{x - 126}{94} & \text{if } 126 \le x \le 220 \\ 1 & \text{if } x = 220 \\ \frac{413 - x}{193} & \text{if } 220 \le x \le 413 \\ 0 & \text{for } x > 413 \end{cases} \quad \text{and } \mathcal{G}_{\tilde{E}^{I}}(x) = \begin{cases} 1 & \text{for } x < 100 \\ \frac{220 - x}{120} & \text{if } 100 \le x \le 220 \\ 0 & \text{if } x = 220 \\ \frac{x - 220}{219} & \text{if } 220 \le x \le 439 \\ 1 & \text{for } x > 439 \end{cases}$$

#### **3. CONCLUSION**

In this paper, the Assignment Problem is considered under intuitionistic triangular fuzzy sets and for the first time the constructive heuristic Dhouib-Matrix-AP1 (DM-AP1) is proposed to solve it with a time complexity of O(n). In fact, DM-AP1 presents only one iterative structure with three simple steps and using the standard deviation statistical metric. The performance of the DM-AP1 heuristic to solve Assignment Problem under intuitionistic triangular fuzzy environment is proved via two case studies with a step-by-step applications.

The major advantage of DM-AP1 is its rapidity to generate an initial basic feasible solution (just *n* iterations) and its flexibility to use any differential statistical metric (several initial solutions can be generated by the use of different statistical metrics). However, DM-AP1 is a greedy deterministic method without any stochastic perturbation. Thus for further research, DM-AP1 will be combined with the novel multi-start metaheuristic Dhouib-Matrix-4 [46, 47, 48] in order to solve larger variants of the Assignment Problem. Further empirical studies have to be performed to evaluate the performance of the proposed method DM-AP1 for unraveling the Assignment Problem under multi-objective domain and neutrosophic environment. Moreover, other applications of DM-AP1 on different variants

of the Assignment Problem need to be performed such as minimizing the bottleneck Assignment Problem or the generalized Assignment Problem.

Funding. This research received no external funding.

#### REFERENCES

- [1] H. Kuhn, "The Hungarian method for the assignment problem", *Naval Research Logistics Quarterly*, vol. 2, no. 1, pp. 83–97, 1955, DOI: 10.1002/nav.3800020109.
- [2] L.F. McGinnis, "Implementation and Testing of a Primal-Dual Algorithm for the Assignment Problem", *Operations Research*, vol. 31, no. 2, pp. 277-291, 1983, DOI: 10.1287/opre.31.2.277.
- [3] D. Avis and L. Devroye, "An analysis of a decomposition heuristic for the assignment problem", *Operation Research Letter*, vol. 3, no. 6, pp. 279-283, 1985, DOI: 10.1016/0167-6377(85)90001-X.
- [4] D.P. Bertsekas, "The Auction Algorithm: A Distributed Relaxation Method for the Assignment Problem", Annals of Operations Research, vol. 14, no. 1-4, pp 105–123, 1988, DOI: 10.1007/BF02186476.
- [5] A.V. Goldberg and R. Kennedy, "An Efficient Cost Scaling Algorithm for the Assignment Problem", *Mathematical Programming: Series A and B*, vol. 71, no. 2, pp 153–177, 1995, DOI: 10.1007/BF01585996.
- [6] S.P. Eberhardt, T. Duad, D.A. Kerns, T.X. Brown and A.P. Thakoor, "Competitive neural architecture for hardware solution to the assignment problem", *Neural Networks*, vol. 4, no. 4, pp. 431-442, 1991, DOI: 10.1016/0893-6080(91)90039-8.
- [7] P.C. Chu, and J.E. Beasley, "A Genetic Algorithm for the Generalized Assignment Problem", *Computers & Operations Research*, vol. 24, no. 1, pp. 17-23, 1997, DOI: 10.1016/S0305-0548(96)00032-9.
- [8] N. Leite, F. Melício and A.C. Rosa, "A fast simulated annealing algorithm for the examination timetabling problem", *Expert Systems with Applications*, vol. 122, no. 15, pp. 137-151, 2019, DOI: 10.1016/j.eswa.2018.12.048.
- [9] M. Chen, X. Tang, T. Song, C. Wu, S. Liu and X. Peng, "A Tabu search algorithm with controlled randomization for constructing feasible university course timetables", *Computers & Operations Research*, vol. 123, Paper ID: 105007, PP. 1-12, 2020, DOI: 10.1016/j.cor.2020.105007.
- [10] A.L. Bolaji, A.T. Khader, M.A. Al-Betar and M.A. Awadallah, "University course timetabling using hybridized artificial bee colony with hill climbing optimizer", *Journal of Computational Science*, vol. 5, no. 5, pp. 809-818, 2014, DOI: 10.1016/j.jocs.2014.04.002.
- [11] P. He, G. Jiang, S. Lam and Y. Sun, "ML-MMAS: Self-learning ant colony optimization for multi-criteria journey planning", *Information Sciences*, vol. 609, pp. 1052-1074, 2022, DOI: 10.1016/j.ins.2022.07.150.
- [12] B. A. Aldeeb, M.A. Al-Betar, N. MD. Norwawi, K.A. Alissa, M.K. Alsmadi, A.A. Hazaymeh and M. Alzaqebah, "Hybrid intelligent water Drops algorithm for examination timetabling problem", *Journal of King Saud University - Computer and Information Sciences*, vol. 34, no. 8, Part A, pp. 4847-4859, 2021, DOI: 10.1016/j.jksuci.2021.06.016.
- [13] S. Dhouib, "An Intelligent Assignment Problem Using Novel Heuristic: The Dhouib-Matrix-AP1 (DM-AP1): Novel Method for Assignment Problem", *International Journal of Intelligent Systems and Applications in Engineering*, vol. 10, no. 1, pp. 135–141, 2022, DOI: 10.18201/ijisae.2022.277.
- [14] Dhouib S. "Novel Optimization Method for Unbalanced Assignment Problems with Multiple Jobs: The Dhouib-Matrix-AP2", *Intelligent Systems with Applications*, vol. 17, ID: 200179, DOI: 10.1016/j.iswa.2023.200179.
- [15] K.T. Atanassov, "Intuitionistic Fuzzy Sets", Fuzzy sets and systems, vol. 20, no. 1, pp. 87-96, 1986.
- [16] L. Zadeh, "Fuzzy sets", Information and Control, vol. 8, no. 3, pp. 338–353, 1965, DOI: 10.1016/S0019-9958(65)90241-X.
- [17] S. Dhouib, "Novel Heuristic for Intuitionistic Triangular Fuzzy Travelling Salesman Problem", International Journal of Applied Evolutionary Computation, vol. 12, no. 4, pp. 39-55, 2021, https://doi.org/ 10.4018/IJAEC.2021100104.

- [18] S. Dhanasekar, A. Manivannan and V. Parthiban, "Fuzzy Diagonal Optimal Algorithm to Solve Intuitionistic Fuzzy Assignment Problems", *International Journal of Civil Engineering and Technology*, vol. 9, no. 11, pp. 378–383, 2018.
- [19] P.S. Kumar and R.J. Hussain, "A Simple Method for Solving Fully Intuitionistic Fuzzy Real Life Assignment Problem", *International Journal of Operations Research and Information Systems*, vol. 7, no. 2, 2016, DOI: 10.4018/IJORIS.2016040103.
- [20] A.N. Gani, J. Kavikumar and V.N. Mohamed, "An Algorithm for Solving Intuitionistic Fuzzy Linear Bottleneck Assignment Problems", *Journal of Technology Management and Business*, vol. 02, no. 02, pp 1-12, 2015.
- [21] C. Veeramani, M.J. Robinson and S. Vasanthi, "Value- and Ambiguity-Based Approach for Solving Intuitionistic Fuzzy Transportation Problem with Total Quantity Discounts and Incremental Quantity Discounts", *Advances in Numerical Optimisation: Theory, Models, and Applications*, vol. 2020, Article ID 8891713, 2020, DOI: 10.1155/2020/8891713.
- [22] S. Fidanova and K.T. Atanassov, "ACO with Intuitionistic Fuzzy Pheromone Updating Applied on Multiple-Constraint Knapsack Problem", *Mathematics*, vol. 9, no. 1456, pp 1-7, 2021, DOI: 10.3390/math9131456.
- [23] E. Bas, E. Egrioglu and E. Kolemen, "A novel intuitionistic fuzzy time series method based on bootstrapped combined pi-sigma artificial neural network", *Engineering Applications of Artificial Intelligence*, vol. 114, paper ID: 105030, 2022, DOI: 10.1016/j.engappai.2022.105030.
- [24] S.K. Ghosh, A. Ghosh and S. Bhattacharyya, "Recognition of cancer mediating biomarkers using rough approximations enabled intuitionistic fuzzy soft sets based similarity measure", *Applied Soft Computing*, vol. 124, Paper ID: 109052, 2022, DOI: 10.1016/j.asoc.2022.109052.
- [25] R. Krishankumar, S.K. Ravichandran and A.B. Saeid "A new extension to PROMETHEE under intuitionistic fuzzy environment for solving supplier selection problem with linguistic preferences", *Applied Soft Computing*, vol. 60, pp. 564-576, 2017, DOI: 10.1016/j.asoc.2017.07.028.
- [26] R. Krishankumar, S.K. Ravichandran and S.K. Tyagi "Solving cloud vendor selection problem using intuitionistic fuzzy decision framework", *Neural Computing and Applications*, vol. 32, pp. 589–602, 2020, DOI: 10.1007/s00521-018-3648-1.
- [27] K. Kokkinos, E. Nathanail, V. Gerogiannis, K. Moustakas and V. Karayannis, "Hydrogen storage station location selection in sustainable freight transportation via intuitionistic hesitant decision support system", *Energy*, vol. 260, Paper ID: 125008, 2022, DOI: 10.1016/j.energy.2022.125008.
- [28] J. Zhao, L. Lin and C. Lin, "A General Fuzzy Cerebellar Model Neural Network Multidimensional Classifier Using Intuitionistic Fuzzy Sets for Medical Identification", *Computational Intelligence and Neuroscience*, vol. 2016, Article ID 8073279, pp. 1-9, 2016, DOI: 10.1155/2016/8073279.
- [29] S.K. De, R. Biswas and A.R. Roy, "An application of intuitionistic fuzzy sets in medical diagnosis", *Fuzzy Sets and Systems*, vol. 117, no. 2, pp. 209-213, 2001, DOI:10.1016/S0165-0114(98)00235-8.
- [30] I.K. Vlachos and G.D. Sergiadis, "Intuitionistic fuzzy information Applications to pattern recognition", *Pattern Recognition Letters*, vol. 28, pp. 197–206, 2007, DOI: 10.1016/j.patrec.2006.07.004.
- [31] S. Shahzadi and M. Akram, "Intuitionistic fuzzy soft graphs with applications", *Journal of Applied Mathematical Computing*, vol. 55, pp. 369–392, 2017, DOI: 10.1007/s12190-016-1041-8.
- [32] M. Akram and N.O. Alshehri, "Intuitionistic Fuzzy Cycles and Intuitionistic Fuzzy Trees", *The Scientific World Journal*, vol. 2014, Article ID 305836, pp. 1-11, 2014, DOI: 10.1155/2014/305836.
- [33] M. Çitil, "Application of the Intuitionistic Fuzzy Logic in Education", Communications in Mathematics and Applications, vol. 10, no. 1, pp. 131–143, 2019, DOI: 10.26713/cma.v10i1.964.
- [34] M. Osorio, J.A. Navarro and J. Arrazola, "Applications of Intuitionistic Logic in Answer Set Programming", *Theory and Practice of Logic Programming*, vol. 4, no. 3, pp. 325–354, 2004, DOI: 10.1017/S1471068403001881.
- [35] A. Varghese and S. Kuriakose, "Centroid of an intuitionistic fuzzy number", Notes on Intuitionistic Fuzzy Sets, vol. 18, no. 1, pp. 19–24, 2012.

- 480 S. Dhouib / Assignment Problem under Intuitionistic Triangular Fuzzy Environment
- [36] S. Dhouib and T. Sutikno, "Solving the trapezoidal fuzzy assignment problem using the novel Dhouib-Matrix-AP1 heuristic", *Bulletin of Electrical Engineering and Informatics*, Vol. 12, No. 2, pp. 1111-1118, 2022, DOI: 10.11591/eei.v12i2.4855.
- [37] S. Dhouib, "Optimization of Travelling Salesman Problem on Single Valued Triangular Neutrosophic Number using Dhouib-Matrix-TSP1 Heuristic", *International Journal of Engineering*, vol. 34, no. 12, pp. 2642-2647, 2021, DOI: 10.5829/IJE.2021.34.12C.09.
  [38] S. Dhouib, "Neutrosophic Triangular Fuzzy Travelling Salesman Problem Based on Dhouib-
- [38] S. Dhouib, "Neutrosophic Triangular Fuzzy Travelling Salesman Problem Based on Dhouib-Matrix-TSP1 Heuristic", *International Journal of Computer and Information Technology*, vol. 10, no. 5, pp 180-183, 2021, DOI: 10.24203/ijcit.v10i5.154.
- [39] S. Dhouib, "Minimizing the Total Distance for the Supply Chain Problem Using Dhouib-Matrix-TSP2 Method", *International Journal of Advanced Research in Engineering and Technology*, vol. 12, no. 5, pp. 1-12, 2021, DOI: 10.34218/IJARET.12.5.2021.001.
- [40] S. Dhouib, S. Broumi and M. Lathamaheswari, "Single Valued Trapezoidal Neutrosophic Travelling Salesman Problem with Novel Greedy Method: The Dhouib-Matrix-TSP1 (DM-TSP1)", *International Journal of Neutrosophic Science*, vol. 17, no. 2, pp. 144-157, 2021, DOI: 10.54216/IJNS.170205.
- [41] S. Dhouib, A. Zouari, S. Dhouib and H. Chabchoub, "Integrating the Artificial Bee Colony Metaheuristic with Dhouib-Matrix-TSP1 heuristic for Holes Drilling Problems", *Journal of Industrial and Production Engineering*, 2022, DOI: 10.1080/21681015.2022.2158499.
- [42] S. Dhouib, "Solving the Single-Valued Trapezoidal Neutrosophic Transportation Problems through the Novel Dhouib-Matrix-TP1 Heuristic", *Mathematical Problems in Engineering*, vol. 2021, Article ID 3945808, pp. 1-11, 2021, DOI: 10.1155/2021/3945808.
- [43] S. Dhouib, "Solving the Trapezoidal Fuzzy Transportation Problems Via New Heuristic the Dhouib-Matrix-TP1", *International Journal of Operations Research and Information Systems*, vol. 12, no. 4, pp1-16, 2021, DOI: 10.4018/IJORIS.294119.
- [44] S. Dhouib, "A New Exact Method for the Shortest Path Problem: The Dhouib-Matrix-SPP (DM-SPP)", 2023, Submitted.
- [45] S. Dhouib, "Novel Metaheuristic Based on Iterated Constructive Stochastic Heuristic: Dhouib-Matrix-3 (DM3)", *Applied Computational Intelligence and Soft Computing*, vol. 2021, Article ID 7761993, pp. 1-10, 2021, DOI: 10.1155/2021/7761993.
- [46] S. Dhouib and A. Zouari, "Adaptive Iterated Stochastic Metaheuristic to Optimize Holes Drilling Path in Food Industry: The Adaptive-Dhouib-Matrix-3 (A-DM3)", *Engineering Applications of Artificial Intelligence*, vol. 120, ID: 105898, 2023, DOI: 10.1016/j.engappai.2023.105898.
- [47] S. Dhouib and A. Zouari, "Optimizing the Non-Productive Time of Robotic Arm for Drilling Circular Holes Network Patterns via the Dhouib-Matrix-3 Metaheuristic", *International Journal of Mechatronics and Manufacturing Systems*, 2023, DOI: 10.1504/IJMMS.2023.10054319, In press.
- [48] S. Dhouib, "Holes Drilling Route Optimization in Printed Circuit Board Using Far-to-Near Metaheuristic", *International Journal of Strategic Engineering*, vol. 5, no. 1, pp. 1-12, 2022, DOI: 10.4018/IJoSE.301568.
- [49] S. Dhouib, "Multi-Start Constructive Heuristic through Descriptive Statistical Metrics: The Dhouib-Matrix-4 (DM4) Metaheuristic", *International Journal of Operational Research*, DOI: 10.1504/IJOR.2021.10045069, 2023, In Press.
- [50] S. Dhouib and D. Pezer, "A Novel Metaheuristic Approach for Drilling Process Planning Optimization: Dhouib-Matrix-4 (DM4)", *International Journal of Artificial Intelligence*, vol. 20, no.2, pp. 80-92, 2022.
- [51] S. Dhouib, "Finding the Shortest Holes Drilling Path in Printed Circuit Board via the Dhouib-Matrix-4 Technique", Advances in Transdisciplinary Engineering, Mechatronics and Automation Technology, vol. 33, pp. 396-401, DOI: 10.3233/ATDE221192, 2022.