

## ON A PROOF OF THE ERDŐS-MONK THEOREM

Žarko Mijajlović

**Abstract.** We prove an elementary proposition of combinatorial analysis, which with some use of model theory of Boolean algebras gives immediately the Erdős-Monk theorem. We shall prove also a generalization of this theorem.

Assuming the Continuum Hypothesis (*CH*) holds, Erdős and Monk proved [2] that  $P(\omega)/I_0 \cong P(\omega)/I$ , where  $P(\omega)$  is the Boolean algebra of all subsets of  $\omega$ -the set natural numbers, and  $I_0, I$  are the following ideals of  $P(\omega)$ :

$$I_0 = \{a \subseteq \omega : a \text{ is finite}\}, \quad I = \{a \subseteq \omega : \sum_{n \in a} 1/n < \infty\},$$

### 1. An elementary statement of combinatorial analysis.

If  $f, g : \omega \rightarrow 2$ ,  $2 = \{0, 1\}$ , then  $f \leq g$  denotes  $\forall n \in \omega f(n) \leq g(n)$ . The following proposition may have an independent interest, so this is the reason why we extracted it.

**THEOREM 1.1.** 1° Let  $f_n \in 2^\omega$ ,  $n \in \omega$ , be a sequence of functions such that

$$(1) \dots f_2 \leq f_1 \leq f_0, \quad (2) \sum_{f_i(n)=1} 1/n = \infty, \quad i \in \omega.$$

Then there is an  $h \in 2^\omega$  such that

$$(1') \sum_{h(n)=1} 1/n = \infty, \quad (2') \sum_{f_i(n) < h(n)} 1/n < \infty, \quad i \in \omega.$$

2° Let  $f_n, g_n \in 2^\omega$ ,  $n \in \omega$ , be two sequences of functions such such that

$$(3) g_0 \leq g_1 \leq g_2 \leq \dots \text{ and } \dots \leq f_2 \leq f_1 \leq f_0, \quad (4) \sum_{f_i(n) < g_i(n)} 1/n < \infty, \quad i \in \omega.$$

Then there is an  $h \in 2^\omega$  such that

$$(3') \sum_{h(n) < g_i(n)} 1/n < \infty, \quad i \in \omega, \quad (4') \sum_{f_i(n) < h(n)} 1/n < \infty, \quad i \in \omega.$$

*Proof.* 1° Let  $a_i = \{n \in \omega : f_i(n) = 1\}$ ,  $n \in \omega$ . Then by the assumption on the functions  $f_n$ , we have

$$(5) \quad a_0 \supseteq a_1 \supseteq a_2 \supseteq \cdots$$

Define a sequence  $b_n \subseteq \omega$  by induction in the following way. Let  $b_0 \subseteq a_0$  be the (finite) subset of first elements in  $a_0$  such that  $\sum_{n \in b_0} 1/n \geq 1$ . Let  $b_{i+1}$  be the subset of first elements in  $a_{i+1} - (b_0 \cup \cdots \cup b_i)$  so that  $\sum_{n \in b_{i+1}} 1/n \geq 1$ ,  $i \in \omega$ . The sets  $b_i$  exist by (2) and (5). Let  $b = \cup_i b_i$ , and define  $h$  to be characteristic function of  $b$ . Then

$$\sum_{h(n)=1} 1/n = \sum_{n \in b} 1/n = \sum_{i \in \omega} \sum_{n \in b_i} 1/n = \infty$$

i. e. (1') holds. Further,  $\{n \in \omega : f_i(n) < h(n)\} \subseteq b_0 \cup \cdots \cup b_i$ ; so, the sum  $\sum_{f_i(n) < h(n)} 1/n$  is finite, i. e. (2') holds.

2° By (4) there exists a strictly increasing sequence  $0 < s_0 < s_1 < s_2 \cdots$  of natural numbers such that

$$\sum_{\substack{f_k(n) < g_k(n) \\ s_k \leq n}} 1/n \leq 1/(k+1)^2, \quad k \in \omega.$$

Let  $h \in 2^\omega$  defined by

$$h(n) = \begin{cases} 0 & \text{if } n < s_0 \\ g_k(n) & \text{iff } s_k \leq n < s_{k+1}. \end{cases}$$

Then

$$\sum_{h(n) < g_k(n)} 1/n = \sum_{\substack{h(n) < g_k(n) \\ n < s_{k+1}}} 1/n + \sum_{\substack{h(n) < g_k(n) \\ s_{k+1} \leq n}} 1/n = A + B.$$

Then  $A$  is a finite sum and  $B = 0$ ; so (3') holds. Furthermore, let

$$\sum_{f_k(n) < h(n)} 1/n = \sum_{\substack{f_k(n) < h(n) \\ n < s_k}} 1/n + \sum_{k \leq i} \sum_{\substack{f_k(n) < h(n) \\ s_i \leq n < s_{i+1}}} 1/n = A + B.$$

Then  $A$  is a finite sum, and so  $A < \infty$ . Furthermore,

$$B = \sum_{k \leq i} \sum_{\substack{f_k(n) < g_i(n) \\ s_i \leq n < s_{i+1}}} 1/n \leq \sum_{k \leq i} \sum_{\substack{f_i(n) < g_i(n) \\ s_i \leq n < s_{i+1}}} 1/n \leq \sum_{k \leq i} 1/(i+1)^2 < \infty$$

i. e. (4') holds.

## 2. $\omega_1$ -saturated Boolean algebras

In [3; Prop. 2.27] it is proved that an atomless Boolean algebra  $B$  is  $\omega_1$ -saturated iff  $B$  satisfies the following condition:

- $H_{\omega_1}$  (1) If  $0 < \dots < a_2 < a_1 < a_0$  is a sequence of elements of  $B$ , then there exists a  $c \in B$  such that  $0 < c < a_n$ ,  $n \in \omega$ .
- (2) If  $0 < a_0 < a_1 < \dots < b_1 < b_0$  are two sequences of elements in  $B$ , then there is a  $c \in B$  such that  $a_n < c < b_n$ ,  $n \in \omega$ .

Using  $H_{\omega_1}$  we proved in [3; Example 2.28] that

- (1)  $P(\omega)/I_0$  is an  $\omega_1$ -saturated Boolean algebra.

Let  $D$  be the dual filter of i. e.  $D = \{a^c : a \in I\}$ . We first observe that

- (2) If  $f_I, g_I \in 2^\omega/I$  are such that  $f_I \leq g_I$ , then there is a  $h \in 2^\omega$  such that  $f_I = h_I$  and  $h \leq g$ .

To see that, let  $a = \{i \in \omega : f(i) \leq g(i)\}$ . Then  $a \in D$ , and the function  $h$  defined by  $h(i) = f(i)$  if  $i \in a$ , and  $h(i) = g(i)$  if  $i \in a^c$ , satisfies the required condition.

Let  $f_I, g_I \in P(\omega)/I$  be such that  $f_I < g_I$ . By (2) we may assume that  $f \leq g$ . Since  $f_I < g_I$  we have  $f_I \neq g_I$ , i. e.  $\{i \in \omega : f(i) = g(i)\} \notin D$ , so  $\{i \in \omega : f(i) \neq g(i)\} \notin I$ . As  $f \leq g$ , then  $f(i) \neq g(i)$  implies  $f(i) < g(i)$ , so  $\sum_{f(i) < g(i)} 1/n = \infty$ . Thus we proved

- (3) Iff  $f \leq g$ , then  $f_I < g_I$  is equivalent to  $\sum_{f(n) < g(n)} 1/n = \infty$ .

Finally, for  $f, g \in 2^\omega$  we have  $f_I \leq g_I$  iff  $\{n : g(n) \leq f(n)\} \in D$  iff  $\{n : g(n) \leq f(n)\}^c \in I$  iff  $\{n : f(n) < g(n)\} \in I$  iff  $\sum_{f(n) < g(n)} 1/n < \infty$ , i. e.

- (4)  $g_I \leq f_I$  is equivalent to  $\sum_{f(n) < g(n)} 1/n < \infty$ .

Using (2), (3), (4) and Theorem 1.1 it follows immediately that  $P(\omega)/I$  satisfies the condition  $H_{\omega_1}$ , therefore we have

**THEOREM 2.1.**  $P(\omega)/I$  is an atomless  $\omega_1$ -Boolean algebra.

If  $CH$  is assumed, then  $|P(\omega)/I| = |P(\omega)/I_0| = \omega_1$ ; so  $P(\omega)/I_0$  and  $P(\omega)/I$  are saturated Boolean algebras of the complete theory of atomless Boolean algebras; therefore by uniqueness of elementary equivalent saturated models of the given cardinality [1; Theorem 5.1.13] we have at once

**COROLLARY 2.2.** If  $CH$  is assumed, then  $P(\omega)/I_0 \cong P(\omega)/I$ .

Let us now give a generalization of the Erdős-Monk theorem. In [4] the notion of saturative filters is introduced. A filter  $F$  over a set  $J$  is  $k$ -saturative iff for every family of models  $A_i$ ,  $i \in J$ , the reduced product  $\prod_{i \in J} A_i/F$  is  $k$ -saturated. In [4] it is proved

**THEOREM 2.3.** *Assume  $F$  is a filter over a set  $J$ . Then  $F$  is  $k$ -saturative ( $k > \omega$ ) iff  $F$  satisfies the following conditions: 1°  $F$  is  $k$ -good, 2° The reduced product  $2^J/F$  is  $\omega_1$ -saturated, 3°  $F$  is incomplete.*

As the proof of Lemma 4.2.2. in [3] shows, every filter over  $\omega$  is  $\omega_1$ -good. Since  $I_0 \subseteq I$  by Theorem 2.1 and Theorem 2.2 we have

**PROPOSITION 2.4.** *The dual filter  $D$  of  $I$  is  $\omega_1$ -saturative.*

**COROLLARY 2.5.** *Let  $B_i$ ,  $i \in \omega$ , be the Boolean algebras. Then*

1°  $\prod_i B_i/D$  is an  $\omega_1$ -saturated Boolean algebra.

2° If CH is assumed and if for all  $i \in \omega$   $|B_i| \leq \omega_1$ , then  $\prod_i B_i/D$  is an atomless saturated Boolean algebra of cardinality  $\omega_1$ , and therefore

$\prod_i B_i/D \cong 2^\omega/D (= (P\omega)/I)$  if subsets of  $\omega$  are identified by their characteristic functions.

#### REFERENCES

- [1] C. C. Chang, H. J. Keisler, *Model Theory*, North-Holland, Amsterdam, 1973.
- [2] W. Just, A. Krawczyk, *On certain Boolean algebras  $P(\omega)/I$* , Trans. Amer. Math. Soc. **285** (1984), 411–428.
- [3] Ž. Mijajlović, *Saturated Boolean algebras with ultrafilters*, Publ. Inst. Math. (Beograd) (N. S.) **26** (40) (1979), 175–197.
- [4] S. Shelah, *Generalization of theorems on ultraproduct to reduced products*, manuscript, 1969.

Odsek za matematiku  
Prirodno-matematički fakultet  
11000 Beograd  
Yugoslavia

(Received 24 11 1984)